BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03342 9127

CONTRACTS

CASES AND MATERIALS

Brian Langille

VOLUME II

1998-99

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
SEP 11 1998
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONTRACTS

CASES AND MATERIALS

Brian Langille

VOLUME II

1998-99

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

VOLUME I

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 AN OVERVIEW: Some Thoughts on Law and the Law of Contracts

Fuller and Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages.....1.1
A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism about Normalism" 1.2
R. Dworkin, Law's Empire..... 1.3
R. Heilbroner, The Making of Economic Society..... 1.4
Questions.....1.9

CHAPTER 2 REMEDIES

2.1 DAMAGES

Wertheim v. Chicoutimi Pulp 2.1.1
Peevyhouse v. Garland Coal & Mining 2.1.1
Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State and Utopia..... 2.1.7
Harris, Ogus & Phillips, "Contract Remedies and the Consumer Surplus".....2.1.11
Hawkins v. McGee.....2.1.15
Fuller and Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages" 2.1.18
Bush v. Canfield.....2.1.27
Acme Mills & Elevator v. Johnson.....2.1.31
Restatement of The Law of Contract s.90.....2.1.34
Anglia Television v. Reed.....2.1.35
A.I. Ogus, "Damages for Pre-Contractual Expenditure.....2.1.37
Bowlay Logging v. Domtar.....2.1.38
Posner, Economic Analysis of Law 2.1.41
I. Macneil, "Efficient Breach of contract: Circles in the Sky".....2.1.42
Dworkin, Law's Empire 2.1.45
Deglman v. Guarantee Trust 2.1.46
Moses v. Macferlan.....2.1.49
Ruxley Electronics and Constructions Ltd. 2.1.50

2.2 SPECIFIC PERFORMANCE

R.J. Sharpe, Studies in Contract Law 2.2.1
Warner Brothers Pictures Inc. v. Nelson..... 2.2.2
Kronman, "Specific Performance"..... 2.2.7

Schwartz, "The Case for Specific Performance" 2.2.12
Brown, "Contract Remedies in a Planned Economy: Labour Arbitration Leads the Way" 2.2.17
Wroth v. Tyler 2.2.22
Behnke v. Bede Shipping Co. 2.2.29
Co-operative Insurance Society Ltd. v. Argyll Stores (Holdings) Ltd. (Court of Appeal) 2.2.30
Co-operative Insurance Society Ltd. v. Argyll Stores (Holdings) Ltd. (House of Lords) 2.2.36
Semelhago v. Paramadevan 2.2.53

2.3 REMOTENESS/FORESEEABILITY

Hadley v. Baxendale 2.3.1
Danzig, "Hadley v. Baxendale: A Study in the Industrialization of the Law" 2.3.3
Fuller & Eisenberg, Basic Contract Law 2.3.5
Atiyah, The Rise and Fall of Freedom of Contract 2.3.6
Victoria Laundry v. Newman Industries 2.3.9
Koufos v. Czarnikow (The Heron II) 2.3.15
Cornwall Gravel v. Purolator Courier Ltd. 2.3.22

2.4 INTANGIBLE INJURIES

Addis v. Gramophone Co. 2.4.1
Jarvis v. Swans Tours Ltd. 2.4.4
Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity" 2.4.7
Vorvis v. Insurance Corporation of British Columbia 2.4.13
Malik v. B.C.C.I. 2.4.27
Wallace v. United Grain Growers Ltd. 2.4.59

2.5 MITIGATION

Payzu Ltd. v. Saunders 2.5.1
Finelli v. Dee 2.5.5
Asamera Oil Corp. v. Sea Oil & General Corp. 2.5.7
White and Carter (Councils) v. McGregor 2.5.16

CHAPTER 3 THE THRESHOLD OF ENFORCEABILITY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Fuller, "Consideration and Form" 3.1.1
M.A. Eisenberg, "The Bargain Principle and Its Limits 3.1.20
Christie v. York Corporation 3.1.26

3.2 BARGAIN THEORY

C. Fried, Contract As Promise 3.2.1
White v. Bluett 3.2.8
Hohfeld, "Fundamental Legal Conceptions" Chart 3.2.9
Thomas v. Thomas 3.2.10

Hamer v. Sidway 3.2.12
Milner, Huck Finn reference 3.2.14
Dalhousie College v. Boutilier Estate 3.2.15
The Santanita 3.2.24
Milner, "Note on the History of Consideration" 3.2.25
Fuller & Eisenberg, "Note on the History of Contract in the Common Law" 3.2.27
Great Northern Railway Co. v. Witham 3.2.34
Firm Offer Note 3.2.37
Greenberg v. Lake Simcoe Ice Supply Co. 3.2.39
Tobias v. Dick T. Eaton Co. 3.2.41
Wood v. Lucy, Lady Duff-Gordon 3.2.43

3.3 PAST CONSIDERATION

Lampleigh v. Brathwait 3.3.1
Roscorla v. Thomas 3.3.2
Poa On v. Lau Yiu Long 3.3.3
Note on Infants' Contracts and the Effect of the Statute of Limitations 3.3.6

3.4 COMPROMISES

Cook v. Wright 3.4.1
Alliance Bank v. Broom 3.4.3
Fairgrief v. Ellis 3.4.5

3.5 INTENTION TO CREATE LEGAL RELATIONS

Weeks v. Tybald 3.5.1
Balfour v. Balfour 3.5.1
Jones v. Padavatton 3.5.5
Upton-On-Severn Rural District Council v. Powell 3.5.11
R. Unger, "The Critical Legal Studies Movement" 3.5.12
C. Dalton, "Deconstructing contract Doctrine" 3.5.15

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/contractscasesma02lang

VOLUME II

Table of Contents

3.6 RELIANCE

Harris v. Watson 3.6.1
Stilk v. Myrick 3.6.2
Smith v. Dawson 3.6.3
Gilbert Steel Ltd. v. University Constructions Ltd. 3.6.4
Wishing Well 3.6.8
Aivazian, Trebilcock & Penny, "The Law of Contract Modifications: The Uncertain Quest for a Bench Mark of Enforceability" 3.6.9
Owen Sound Public Library Board v. Mial Developments Ltd. 3.6.31
Foakes v. Beer 3.6.37
Bank of Nova Scotia v. MacLennan 3.6.40
Note on Dive v. Maningham 3.6.42
Hughes v. Metropolitan Ry. Co. 3.6.43
Central London Property Trust Ltd. v. High Trees House Ltd. 3.6.50
Combe v. Combe 3.6.54
Imperator Realty Co. v. Tull 3.6.57
D. & C. Builders v. Rees 3.6.60
Crabb v. Arun District Council 3.6.64
Loranger v. Haines 3.6.70

3.7 UNILATERAL CONTRACTS

Carill v. Carbolic Smoke Ball Co. 3.7.1
Errington v. Errington 3.7.5
Dawson v. Helicopter Exploration Co. 3.7.6

3.8 MISREPRESENTATION

Heilbut, Symons v. Buckleton 3.8.1
Redgrave v. Hurd 3.8.7
Leaf v. International Galleries 3.8.15
Murray v. Sperry Rand 3.8.17
Ranger v. Herbert A. Watts (Quebec) Ltd. 3.8.21
Hedley Byrne v. Heller 3.8.22
Esso Petroleum Co. v. Mardon 3.8.27
Nunes Diamonds v. Dominion Electric Co. 3.8.33
B.C. Hydro v. B.G. Checo 3.8.39

CHAPTER 4 CONTRACT FORMATION

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Note on The Seal 4.1.1
Fuller, "Consideration and Form" 4.1.2

4.2 OBJECTIVE THEORY

Grant v. Province of New Brunswick 4.2.1
Smith v. Hughes 4.2.6
Hobbes v. Esquimault & Nanaimo Ry. Co. 4.2.10
Bell v. Lever Bros Ltd. 4.2.13
Raffles v. Wichelhaus 4.2.14
Grant Gilmore, The Death of Contract 4.2.15
Henkel v. Pape 4.2.20
A.W.B. Simpson, "Contracts for Cotton To Arrive: The Case of the Two Ships Peerless" 4.2.22
Greenberg v. Meffert et al 4.2.49

4.3 UNSIGNED DOCUMENTS

Parker v. South Eastern Railway 4.3.1
Ollie v. Marlborough Court 4.3.9
Thornton v. Shoe Lane Parking 4.3.10
A Ticket Case 4.3.14
McCutcheon v. MacBrayne Ltd 4.3.15
British Crane Hire v. Ispwich Plant Hire 4.3.19

4.4 RULES

Harvey v. Facey 4.4.1
Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain v. Boots Cash Chemists (Southern) Ltd. 4.4.3
Fisher v. Bell 4.4.5
H.L.A. Hart, The Concept of Law 4.4.7
Shatford v. B.C. Wine Growers Ltd. 4.4.8
Hyde v. Wrench 4.4.9
Household Insurance Co. v. Grant 4.4.10
Henthorn v. Fraser 4.4.15
K.N. Llewellin on the Rules of Offer and Acceptance 4.4.17

4.5 BATTLE OF THE FORMS

Butler Machine Tool co. v. Ex-Cell-O Corp (England) Ltd 4.5.1
R. Unger, "The Critical Legal Studies Movement" 4.5.6

4.6 UNCERTAINTY ETC

May and Butcher Ltd. v. R. 4.6.1
Hillas and Co. v. Arcos Ltd 4.6.3
Bristol, Cardiff, and Swansea Aerated Breach Co. v. Maggs 4.6.8
Bellamy v. Debenham 4.6.11
Foley v. Classique Coaches Ltd. 4.6.12
Calvan Consolidated Oil & Gas Ltd v. Manning 4.6.18
Canada Square Corp. v. Versafood Services Ltd. 4.6.20
R. Gordon, "Macaulay, MacNeil, and the Discovery of Solidarity and Power in Contract Law" 4.6.22

4.7 DUTY TO BARGAIN

Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woolen Co. 4.7.1
Courteney and Fairbairn Ltd. v. Tolaini Brothers (Hotels) Ltd. 4.7.3
Hoffman v. Red Owl Stores 4.7.6
William Lacey Ltd. v. Davis 4.7.10
Brewer v. Chrysler 4.7.11
Lac Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd. 4.7.19
Empress Towers Ltd. v. Bank of Nova Scotia 4.7.27

4.8 REASONABLE INTERPRETATION/PAROLE EVIDENCE RULE

Hawrish v. Bank of Montreal 4.8.1
Gallen v. Allstate Grain 4.8.5
Law Reform Commission Recommendations 4.8.15
Corbin on contracts, Parole Evidence "Rule" 4.8.16
Bauer v. Bank of Montreal 4.8.19
Stanley Fish, "The Law Wishes To Have a Formal Existence" 4.8.23
Dalton, "Deconstructing Contract Doctrine" 4.8.35
Stanley Fish, "The Law Wishes to Have a Formal Existence" 4.8.39
Wittgenstein, "Philosophical Investigations" 4.8.42
Chaffee, "The Disorderly Conduct of Words" 4.8.43

CHAPTER 5 PERFORMANCE AND BREACH

Sale of Goods Act R.S.O. 1980 Chapter 462 ..... 5.1
Cehave N.V. v. Bremer 5.2
Arcos v. Ronaasen 5.11
Boone v. Eyre 5.16
Gary Larson, "A Fundamental Breach" 5.17
Hong Kong Fir Shipping Co. v. Kawasaki Kisen Kaisha, Ltd 5.18
Howe v. Smith 5.23
Dies v. British International Mining & Finance Corp. 5.25
Turney and Turney v. Zhilka 5.31
Barnett v. Harrison 5.31

Sumpter v. Hedges 5.32
Cutter v. Powell 5.34

CHAPTER 6 THIRD PARTIES

Midland Silicones Ltd. v. Scruttons Ltd 6.1
New Zealand Shipping Co. v. A.M. Satterthwaite & Co. 6.3
Port Jackson Stevedoring Pty Ltd. v. Salmon & Spraegor (Australia) Pty Ltd. (The New York Star) 6.8
Greenwood Shopping Plaza v. Beattie 6.9
ITO - International Terminal Operators Ltd. v. Miida Electronics Inc 6.17
Jackson v. Horizon Holidays Ltd 6.33
Beswick v. Beswick 6.36
R. Howse, "Attachments by Choice: Liberalism and the Problem of Community" 6.48
London Drugs v. Kuehne and Nagle 6.50

CHAPTER 7 MISTAKEN IDENTITY

Boulton v. Jones 7.1
Cundy v. Lindsay 7.2
King's Norton Metal v. Edridge 7.6
Phillips v. Brooks 7.7
Ingram v. Little 7.11
Lewis v. Averay 7.20

CHAPTER 8 DOCUMENTS MISTAKENLY SIGNED - NON EST FACTUM

Saunders v. Anglia Building Society (Gallie v. Lee) 8.1
Prudential Trust v. Cugnet 8.13
Marvco Colour Research v. Harris 8.22

/courses/newtoc
rev.August 1998

VOLUME III

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 9 MISTAKE

A. Kronman, "Mistake, Disclosure, Information and the Law of Contracts (Includes Laidlaw v. Organ) 9.1
Bell v. Lever Bros. 9.7
Solle v. Butcher 9.15
Sherwood v. Walker (Rose 2d of Aberone) 9.22
T.D. Bank v. Fortin (No. 2) 9.27
Magee v. Pennine Insurance Co. 6.31
McRae v. Commonwealth Disposals Commission 9.34
C. Fried, Contract As Promise 9.45

CHAPTER 10 FRUSTRATION

Wittgenstein, "Philosophical Investigations" 10.1
Paradine v. Jane 10.2
Taylor v. Caldwell 10.3
Snipes Mountain v. Benz Bros. 10.6
Parrish & Heimbecker v. Gooding Lumber 10.11
Krell v. Henry 10.14
David Contractors v. Fareham Urban District Council 10.21
Tsakiroglou v. Noblee Thorl 10.25
Amalgamated Investment v. John Walker 10.31
Capital Quality Homes v. Colwyn Construction 10.35
Posner & Rosenfield, "Impossibility and Related Doctrines in Contract Law: An Economic Analysis" 10.46
Appleby v. Myers 10.55
Fibrosa Spolka Akcyjna v. Fairbairn Lawson Combe Barbour 10.58
Frustrated Contracts Act, R.S.O. 1980, c.179 ..... 10.68

CHAPTER 11 THE LIMITS OF THE CONTRACT PRINCIPLE

11.1 OVERVIEW

Christie v. York ..... see 3.1.26
Post v. Jones 11.1.1
Gilmore, "The Ages of American Law" 11.1.3
Lochner v. New York 11.1.4
Hurley v. Westerman 11.1.10
A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: some Realism About Normalism" 11.1.12
Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State and Utopia ..... see 2.1.8

Milton Friedman, Capitalism and Freedom 11.1.14
C.B. MacPherson, "Elegant Tombstones: A Note on Friedman Freedom" 11.1.16
Two Quotations 11.1.18
D. Kennedy, "Form and Substance in Private law Adjudication" 11.1.19
R. Posner, The Economics of Justice 11.1.26
Scanlon, "Liberty, Contract and Contribution" 11.1.28
Alchain and Allen, University Economics 11.1.29
Rawls, A Theory of Justice 11.1.30
A.T. Kronman, "Contract Law and Distributive Justice" 11.1.31
A.A. Leff, "Unconscionability and the Code - The Emperor's New Clause" 11.1.38

11.2 EXEMPTION CLAUSES/"FUNDAMENTAL BREACH"

Canadian Dominion Leading Corp v. Suburban Superdrug 11.2.1
Harbutt's Plasticine v. Wayne Tank Co. 11.2.7
Canso Chemicals Ltd. v. Canadian Westinghouse 11.2.14
Photo Production Ltd. v. Securicor Transport Ltd 11.2.22
Gallen v. Allstate Grain ..... see 4.8.5
Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncrude Canada Ltd. 11.2.29
Geo Mitchell v. Finney Lock Seeds 11.2.54
Davidson v. Three Spruces Realty Ltd. 11.2.60

PENALTY CLAUSES, etc.

Stockloser v. Johnson 11.2.63
H.R. Clarke Ltd. v. Thermidaire Corp. 11.2.71
Shatilla v. Feinstein 11.2.82

11.3 UNCONSCIONABILITY

Henningsen v. Bloomfield Motors 11.3.1
Mundinger v. Mundinger 11.3.10
Lloyds Bank v. Bundy 11.3.14
National West Bank Pk. v. Morgan 11.3.20
Tilden Rent-A-Car v. Clendenning 11.3.23
Pridmore v. Calvert 11.3.31
Macaulay v. Schroeder Music Publishing Co. 11.3.35
McKenzie v. Bank of Montreal 11.3.43
Canadian Kawasaki Motors Ltd. v. McKenzie 11.3.48
Shoppers Trust v. Dynamic Homes 11.3.57
Sale of Goods Act 11.3.62
Consumer Protection Act 11.3.63
Business Practices Act 11.3.65
The Unconscionable Transactions Relief Act 11.3.67
M. Trebilcock, "An Economic Approach to the Doctrine of Unconscionability" 11.3.69
Eisenberg, "The Bargain Principle and its Limits" 11.3.92
Barclays Bank v. O'Brien 11.3.129
C.I.B.C. Mortgages v. Pitt 11.3.136

11.4 PUBLIC POLICY/ILLEGALITY

Gordon v. Ferguson.....11.4.1
Esso Petroleum v. Harper 11.4.8
Pearce v. Brooks 11.4.15
Kiriri Cotton Co. v. Dewani..... 11.4.21
Archbolds v. Spanglett..... 11.4.26
St. John Shipping Corp. v. Joseph Rank Ltd. 11.4.32
Trebilcock & Keshvani, "A Law & Economics Perspective on the Role of Private Ordering in Family Law"..... 11.4.47
Margaret Jane Radin, "Market-Inalienability", Harvard L.R., June 1987 v.100 at 1849..... 11.4.58
In the Matter of Baby "M" 11.4.148
Ian Ayres, "Fair Driving: Gender and Race Discrimination in Retail Car Negotiations".....11.4.150

11.5 AND IN THE END

Nagel, "Libertarianism Without Foundations" 11.5.1
Kennedy, "The Structure of Blackstone's Commentaries".....11.5.2
J. Wisdom, Paradox and Discovery 11.5.4
Atiyah, The Rise and Fall of Freedom of Contract.....11.5.5
Wittengenstein, A Quote.....11.5.6
Mark Twain, Life on the Mississippi.....11.5.7